Money and Markets

In the development of the history of economic thought, contrasting views of money and markets have emerged. Whilst some economists have seen money as an instrument created by individuals in an attempt to overcome the difficulties of barter, others have seen it as something created before the market, maintained and promoted by the State. Similarly, whereas some economists have seen the market as a level playing field, others have seen it dominated by specific group interests.

This book brings together 14 essays by leading authors in the field of economics to look at the relationship between money and markets throughout economic theory and history, thus providing a key to understanding important issues in monetary theory and other important debates in contemporary economics.

Taking a critical stance of much mainstream economics literature and offering alternative arguments, this title is essential reading for postdoctoral researchers in the field of both the history of economics and current economic theory.

Alberto Giacomin is Associate Professor in the History of Economic Thought at the University of Venice. Maria Cristina Marcuzzo is Head of the Department of Economics at the University of Rome.
Routledge studies in the history of economics

1 Economics as Literature
   Willie Henderson

2 Socialism and Marginalism in Economics 1870–1930
   Edited by Ian Steedman

3 Hayek’s Political Economy
   The socio-economics of order
   Steve Fleetwood

4 On the Origins of Classical Economics
   Distribution and value from William Petty to Adam Smith
   Tony Aspromourgos

5 The Economics of Joan Robinson
   Edited by
   Maria Cristina Marcuzzo, Luigi Pasinetti and Alessandro Roncaglia

6 The Evolutionist Economics of Léon Walras
   Albert Jolink

7 Keynes and the ‘Classics’
   A study in language, epistemology and mistaken identities
   Michel Verdon

8 The History of Game Theory, Volume 1
   From the beginnings to 1945
   Robert W. Dimand and Mary Ann Dimand

9 The Economics of W. S. Jevons
   Sandra Peart

10 Gandhi’s Economic Thought
    Ajit K Dasgupta

11 Equilibrium and Economic Theory
    Edited by Giovanni Caravale

12 Austrian Economics in Debate
    Edited by Willem Keizer, Bert Tieben and Rudy van Zijp

13 Ancient Economic Thought
    Edited by B. B. Price

14 The Political Economy of Social Credit and Guild Socialism
    Frances Hutchinson and Brian Burkitt

15 Economic Careers
    Economics and economists in Britain 1930–1970
    Keith Tribe
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Towards an Unknown Marx: A commentary on the manuscripts of 1861–63</td>
<td>Enrique Dussel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Economics and Interdisciplinary Exchange</td>
<td>Edited by Guido Erreygers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Economics as the Art of Thought: Essays in memory of G.L.S. Shackle</td>
<td>Edited by Stephen F. Frowen and Peter Earl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>The Decline of Ricardian Economics: Politics and economics in post-Ricardian theory</td>
<td>Susan Pashkoff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Piero Sraffa: His Life, thought and cultural heritage</td>
<td>Alessandro Roncaglia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>The German Historical School: The historical and ethical approach to economics</td>
<td>Edited by Yuichi Shionoya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Reflections on the Classical Canon in Economics: Essays in honor of Samuel Hollander</td>
<td>Edited by Sandra Peart and Evelyn Forget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Piero Sraffa’s Political Economy: A centenary estimate</td>
<td>Edited by Terenzio Cozzi and Roberto Marchionatti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>The Contribution of Joseph Schumpeter to Economics: Economic development and institutional change</td>
<td>Richard Arena and Cecile Dangel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>On the Development of Long-run Neo-Classical Theory: Tom Kompas</td>
<td>Tom Kompas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>F.A. Hayek as a Political Economist: Economic analysis and values</td>
<td>Edited by Jack Birner, Pierre Garrouste and Thierry Aimar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Pareto, Economics and Society: The mechanical analogy</td>
<td>Michael McLure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>The Cambridge Controversies in Capital Theory: A study in the logic of theory development</td>
<td>Jack Birner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Economics Broadly Considered: Essays in honor of Warren J. Samuels</td>
<td>Edited by Steven G. Medema, Jeff Biddle and John B. Davis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Physicians and Political Economy: Six studies of the work of doctor-economists</td>
<td>Edited by Peter Groenewegen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
50 The Spread of Political Economy and the Professionalisation of Economists
Economic societies in Europe, America and Japan in the nineteenth century
Massimo Augello and Marco Guidi

51 Historians of Economics & Economic Thought
The construction of disciplinary memory
Steven G. Medema and Warren J. Samuels

52 Competing Economic Theories
Essays in memory of Giovanni Caravale
Sergio Nisticò and Domenico Tosato

53 Economic Thought and Policy in Less Developed Europe
The 19th century
Edited by Michalis Psalidopoulos and Maria-Eugenia Almedia Mata

54 Family Fictions and Family Facts
Harriet Martineau, Adolphe Quetelet and the population question in England 1798–1859
Brian Cooper

55 Eighteenth-Century Economics
Peter Groenewegen

56 The Rise of Political Economy in the Scottish Enlightenment
Edited by Tatsuya Sakamoto and Hideo Tanaka

57 Classics and Moderns in Economics, Volume I
Essays on nineteenth and twentieth century economic thought
Peter Groenewegen

58 Classics and Moderns in Economics, Volume II
Essays on nineteenth and twentieth century economic thought
Peter Groenewegen

59 Marshall's Evolutionary Economics
Tiziano Raffaelli

60 Money, Time and Rationality in Max Weber
Austrian connections
Stephen D. Parsons

61 Classical Macroeconomics
Some modern variations and distortions
James C.W. Ahiakpor

62 The Historical School of Economics in England and Japan
Tamotsu Nishizawa

63 Classical Economics and Modern Theory
Studies in long-period analysis
Heinz D. Kurz and Neri Salvadori

64 A Bibliography of Female Economic Thought to 1940
Kirsten K. Madden, Janet A. Sietz and Michele Pujol
65 Economics, Economists and Expectations
From Microfoundations to Macroeconomics
Warren Young, Robert Leeson and William Darity Jnr.

66 The Political Economy of Public Finance in Britain, 1767–1873
Takuo Dome

67 Essays in the History of Economics
Warren J. Samuels, Willie Henderson, Kirk D. Johnson and Marianne Johnson

68 History and Political Economy
Essays in honour of P.D. Groenewegen
Edited by Tony Aspromourgos and John Lodewijks

69 The Tradition of Free Trade
Lars Magnusson

70 Evolution of the Market Process
Austrian and Swedish economics
Edited by Michel Bellet, Sandye Gloria-Palermo and Abdallah Zouache

71 Consumption as an Investment
The fear of goods from Hesiod to Adam Smith
Cosimo Perrotta

72 Jean-Baptiste Say and the Classical Canon in Economics
The British connection in French classicism
Samuel Hollander

73 Knut Wicksell on Poverty
No place is too exalted
Knut Wicksell

74 Economists in Cambridge
A study through their correspondence 1907–1946
Edited by M.C. Marcuzzo and A. Rosselli

75 The Experiment in the History of Economics
Edited by Philippe Fontaine and Robert Leonard

76 At the Origins of Mathematical Economics
The economics of A.N. Isnard (1748–1803)
Richard van den Berg

77 Money and Exchange
Folktales and reality
Sasan Fayazmanesh

78 Economic Development and Social Change
Historical roots and modern perspectives
George Stathakis and Gianni Vaggi

79 Ethical Codes and income distribution
A Study of John Bates Clark and Thorstein Veblen
Guglielmo Forges Davanzati

80 Evaluating Adam Smith
Creating the Wealth of Nations
Willie Henderson
81 Civil Happiness
Economics and human flourishing
in historical perspective
Luigino Bruni

82 New Voices on Adam Smith
Edited by Leonidas Montes and
Eric Schliesser

83 Making Chicago Price Theory
Milton Friedman–George Stigler
correspondence, 1945–1957
Edited by J. Daniel Hammond
and Claire H. Hammond

84 William Stanley Jevons and the
Cutting Edge of Economics
Bert Mosselmans

85 A History of Econometrics in
France
From nature to models
Philippe Le Gall

86 Money and Markets
A doctrinal approach
Edited by Alberto Giacomin and
Maria Cristina Marcuzzo
Money and Markets
A doctrinal approach

Edited by Alberto Giacomin and Maria Cristina Marcuzzo
Contents

List of illustrations xiii
Notes on contributors xiv
Acknowledgements xvi

1 Money and markets: Introduction 1
ALBERTO GIACOMIN AND MARIA CRISTINA MARCUZZO

PART I
Alternative representations of market and monetary relationships 13

2 Monetary and social relationships 15
CHARLES A. E. GOODHART

3 Complexity theory’s network conception of the individual 30
JOHN B. DAVIS

4 Does game theory offer ‘new’ mathematical images of economic reality? 48
GEORGIO ISRAEL

PART II
History of monetary ideas in the light of modern theory 57

5 Money, markets and property 59
GUNNAR HEINSOHN AND OTTO STEIGER

6 Money and market as twin concepts? Some lessons from the recent history of market theory 79
JEAN CARTELIER
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The monetary-policy relevance of an international settlement institution: the Keynes plan 60 years later</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sergio Rossi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Price and prejudice: the statics and dynamics of money-wage flexibility</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Annamaria Simonazzi and Fernando Vianello</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART III**

**At the origin of monetary ideas**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Beyond the quantity theory: a reappraisal of Jean Bodin’s monetary ideas</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jérôme Blanc</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Money as a social bookkeeping device: from mercantilism to General Equilibrium theory</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Heinz-Peter Sphän</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Death in Venice – John Law: art collector, monetary theorist and corporate financier</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Antoine E. Murphy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Paper money: a reassessment of Adam Smith’s view</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alberto Giacomini</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART IV**

**Neglected contributions to monetary theory and policy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>‘Incalculability’ and the heterogeneity of agents in Frederick Lavington’s monetary theory of markets</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cécile Dangel-Hagnauer and Alain Raybaut</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Profit rate, money and economic dynamics in Fanno’s thought</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cristina Nardi Spiller and Mario Pomini</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Money and usury in the economics of Ezra Pound</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meghnad Desai</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 247
Illustrations

Figures
7.1 The two circuits of international money 108
11.1 Law’s Financial System 176
13.1 The prospective net returns of a safe and a risky security 207

Tables
7.1 The result of an international payment in bancor in Keynes’s plan 100
7.2 The result of an international payment in bancor: step I 105
7.3 The result of an international payment in bancor: step II 107
Contributors

Jérôme Blanc is Associate Professor of Economics at the University of Lyon 2 ‘Lumière’, France.

Jean Cartelier is Professor of Economics at the University of Paris X-Nanterre, France.

Cécile Dangel-Hagnauer is Associate Professor at the University of Nice-Sophia Antipolis, France.

John B. Davis is Professor of History and Philosophy of Economics at the University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands and Professor of Economics at Marquette University, USA.

Meghnad Desai is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the London School of Economics, United Kingdom.

Alberto Giacomin is Associate Professor of History of Economic Thought at the University of Venice ‘Cà Foscari’, Italy.

Charles A. E. Goodhart is Emeritus Professor of Banking and Finance, Financial Market Group, at the London School of Economics, United Kingdom.

Gunnar Heinsohn is Professor of Social Sciences at the University of Bremen, Germany.

Giorgio Israel is Professor of History of Mathematics at the University of Rome ‘La Sapienza’, Italy.

Maria Cristina Marcuzzo is Head of the Department of Economics at the University of Rome.

Antoin E. Murphy is Professor of Economics at Trinity College Dublin, Ireland.

Cristina Nardi Spiller is Professor of Macroeconomics and Economics of art at the University of Verona, Italy.

Mario Pomini is Professor of Economics at the University of Padua, Italy.
Contributors

Alain Raybaut is Research Fellow at the University of Nice-Sophia Antipolis, France.

Sergio Rossi is Professor of Economics at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland.

Annamaria Simonazzi is Professor of Political Economy at the University of Rome ‘La Sapienza’, Italy.

Heinz-Peter Spahn is Professor of Economics at the University of Hohenheim, Germany.

Otto Steiger is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the University of Bremen, Germany.

Fernando Vianello is Professor of Macroeconomics and History of Economic Analysis at the University of Rome ‘La Sapienza’, Italy.
Acknowledgements

Brought together in this volume is a selection from the papers presented at the 8th ESHET Conference held in Treviso and Venice on 26–29 February 2004.

Without implicating them in any way, we wish to express our thanks to Tony Aspromourgos, Alberto Baccini, Tony Brewer, Pascal Bridel, Victoria Chick, Ghislain Deleplace, Michel De Vroey, Bruna Ingrao, David Laidler, Arrigo Opocher, Ugo Pagano, Alessandro Roncaglia, Annalisa Rosselli, Bertram Schefold and Roy Weintraub, whose comments and criticisms have been of great help to us in preparing the volume.

In our Introduction we address those issues to which, in our view and in our understanding of the topic, these papers provide a contribution. However, they can and, we hope, will be read following other threads. We have, therefore, chosen not to take them in the same order of presentation as in the table of contents, to stress that our Introduction reflects what we have been stimulated to ponder and learned by reading and editing this book.