

Money and Markets

In the development of the history of economic thought, contrasting views of money and markets have emerged. Whilst some economists have seen money as an instrument created by individuals in an attempt to overcome the difficulties of barter, others have seen it as something created before the market, maintained and promoted by the State. Similarly, whereas some economists have seen the market as a level playing field, others have seen it dominated by specific group interests.

This book brings together 14 essays by leading authors in the field of economics to look at the relationship between money and markets throughout economic theory and history, thus providing a key to understanding important issues in monetary theory and other important debates in contemporary economics.

Taking a critical stance of much mainstream economics literature and offering alternative arguments, this title is essential reading for postdoctoral researchers in the field of both the history of economics and current economic theory.

Alberto Giacomin is Associate Professor in the History of Economic Thought at the University of Venice. **Maria Cristina Marcuzzo** is Head of the Department of Economics at the University of Rome.

Routledge studies in the history of economics

- 1 Economics as Literature**
Willie Henderson
- 2 Socialism and Marginalism in Economics 1870–1930**
Edited by Ian Steedman
- 3 Hayek's Political Economy**
The socio-economics of order
Steve Fleetwood
- 4 On the Origins of Classical Economics**
Distribution and value from William Petty to Adam Smith
Tony Aspromourgos
- 5 The Economics of Joan Robinson**
Edited by Maria Cristina Marcuzzo, Luigi Pasinetti and Alesandro Roncaglia
- 6 The Evolutionist Economics of Léon Walras**
Albert Jolink
- 7 Keynes and the 'Classics'**
A study in language, epistemology and mistaken identities
Michel Verdon
- 8 The History of Game Theory, Volume 1**
From the beginnings to 1945
Robert W. Dimand and Mary Ann Dimand
- 9 The Economics of W. S. Jevons**
Sandra Peart
- 10 Gandhi's Economic Thought**
Ajit K Dasgupta
- 11 Equilibrium and Economic Theory**
Edited by Giovanni Caravale
- 12 Austrian Economics in Debate**
Edited by Willem Keizer, Bert Tieben and Rudy van Zijp
- 13 Ancient Economic Thought**
Edited by B. B. Price
- 14 The Political Economy of Social Credit and Guild Socialism**
Frances Hutchinson and Brian Burkitt
- 15 Economic Careers**
Economics and economists in Britain 1930–1970
Keith Tribe

- 16 Understanding 'Classical' Economics**
Studies in the long-period theory
Heinz Kurz and Neri Salvadori
- 17 History of Environmental Economic Thought**
E. Kula
- 18 Economic Thought in Communist and Post-Communist Europe**
Edited by Hans-Jürgen Wagener
- 19 Studies in the History of French Political Economy**
From Bodin to Walras
Edited by Gilbert Faccarello
- 20 The Economics of John Rae**
Edited by O. F. Hamouda, C. Lee and D. Mair
- 21 Keynes and the Neoclassical Synthesis**
Einsteinian versus Newtonian macroeconomics
Teodoro Dario Togati
- 22 Historical Perspectives on Macroeconomics**
Sixty years after the 'General Theory'
Edited by Philippe Fontaine and Albert Jolink
- 23 The Founding of Institutional Economics**
The leisure class and sovereignty
Edited by Warren J. Samuels
- 24 Evolution of Austrian Economics**
From Menger to Lachmann
Sandye Gloria
- 25 Marx's Concept of Money: the God of Commodities**
Anitra Nelson
- 26 The Economics of James Stuart**
Edited by Ramón Tortajada
- 27 The Development of Economics in Europe since 1945**
Edited by A. W. Bob Coats
- 28 The Canon in the History of Economics**
Critical essays
Edited by Michalis Psalidopoulos
- 29 Money and Growth**
Selected papers of Allyn Abbott Young
Edited by Perry G. Mehrling and Roger J. Sandilands
- 30 The Social Economics of Jean-Baptiste Say**
Markets and virtue
Evelyn L. Forget
- 31 The Foundations of Laissez-Faire**
The economics of Pierre de Boisguilbert
Gilbert Faccarello
- 32 John Ruskin's Political Economy**
Willie Henderson
- 33 Contributions to the History of Economic Thought**
Essays in honour of R.D.C. Black
Edited by Antoin E. Murphy and Renee Prendergast

- 34 Towards an Unknown Marx**
A commentary on the manuscripts of 1861–63
Enrique Dussel
- 35 Economics and Interdisciplinary Exchange**
Edited by Guido Erreygers
- 36 Economics as the Art of Thought**
Essays in memory of G.L.S. Shackle
Edited by Stephen F. Frowen and Peter Earl
- 37 The Decline of Ricardian Economics**
Politics and economics in post-Ricardian theory
Susan Pashkoff
- 38 Piero Sraffa**
His Life, thought and cultural heritage
Alessandro Roncaglia
- 39 Equilibrium and Disequilibrium in Economic Theory**
The Marshall–Walras divide
Michel de Vroey
- 40 The German Historical School**
The historical and ethical approach to economics
Edited by Yuichi Shionoya
- 41 Reflections on the Classical Canon in Economics**
Essays in honor of Samuel Hollander
Edited by Sandra Peart and Evelyn Forget
- 42 Piero Sraffa's Political Economy**
A centenary estimate
Edited by Terenzio Cozzi and Roberto Marchionatti
- 43 The Contribution of Joseph Schumpeter to Economics**
Economic development and institutional change
Richard Arena and Cecile Dangel
- 44 On the Development of Long-run Neo-Classical Theory**
Tom Kompas
- 45 F.A. Hayek as a Political Economist**
Economic analysis and values
Edited by Jack Birner, Pierre Garrouste and Thierry Aimar
- 46 Pareto, Economics and Society**
The mechanical analogy
Michael McLure
- 47 The Cambridge Controversies in Capital Theory**
A study in the logic of theory development
Jack Birner
- 48 Economics Broadly Considered**
Essays in honor of Warren J. Samuels
Edited by Steven G. Medema, Jeff Biddle and John B. Davis
- 49 Physicians and Political Economy**
Six studies of the work of doctor-economists
Edited by Peter Groenewegen

- 50 The Spread of Political Economy and the Professionalisation of Economists**
Economic societies in Europe, America and Japan in the nineteenth century
Massimo Augello and Marco Guidi
- 51 Historians of Economics & Economic Thought**
The construction of disciplinary memory
Steven G. Medema and Warren J. Samuels
- 52 Competing Economic Theories**
Essays in memory of Giovanni Caravale
Sergio Nisticò and Domenico Tosato
- 53 Economic Thought and Policy in Less Developed Europe**
The 19th century
Edited by Michalis Psalidopoulos and Maria-Eugenia Almedia Mata
- 54 Family Fictions and Family Facts**
Harriet Martineau, Adolphe Quetelet and the population question in England 1798–1859
Brian Cooper
- 55 Eighteenth-Century Economics**
Peter Groenewegen
- 56 The Rise of Political Economy in the Scottish Enlightenment**
Edited by Tatsuya Sakamoto and Hideo Tanaka
- 57 Classics and Moderns in Economics, Volume I**
Essays on nineteenth and twentieth century economic thought
Peter Groenewegen
- 58 Classics and Moderns in Economics, Volume II**
Essays on nineteenth and twentieth century economic thought
Peter Groenewegen
- 59 Marshall's Evolutionary Economics**
Tiziano Raffaelli
- 60 Money, Time and Rationality in Max Weber**
Austrian connections
Stephen D. Parsons
- 61 Classical Macroeconomics**
Some modern variations and distortions
James C.W. Ahikpor
- 62 The Historical School of Economics in England and Japan**
Tamotsu Nishizawa
- 63 Classical Economics and Modern Theory**
Studies in long-period analysis
Heinz D. Kurz and Neri Salvadori
- 64 A Bibliography of Female Economic Thought to 1940**
Kirsten K. Madden, Janet A. Sietz and Michele Pujol

- 65 Economics, Economists and Expectations**
From Microfoundations to Macroeconomics
Warren Young, Robert Leeson and William Darity Jnr.
- 66 The Political Economy of Public Finance in Britain, 1767–1873**
Takuo Dome
- 67 Essays in the History of Economics**
Warren J. Samuels, Willie Henderson, Kirk D. Johnson and Marianne Johnson
- 68 History and Political Economy**
Essays in honour of P.D. Groenewegen
Edited by Tony Aspromourgos and John Lodewijks
- 69 The Tradition of Free Trade**
Lars Magnusson
- 70 Evolution of the Market Process**
Austrian and Swedish economics
Edited by Michel Bellet, Sandye Gloria-Palermo and Abdallah Zouache
- 71 Consumption as an Investment**
The fear of goods from Hesiod to Adam Smith
Cosimo Perrotta
- 72 Jean-Baptiste Say and the Classical Canon in Economics**
The British connection in French classicism
Samuel Hollander
- 73 Knut Wicksell on Poverty**
No place is too exalted
Knut Wicksell
- 74 Economists in Cambridge**
A study through their correspondence 1907–1946
Edited by M.C. Marcuzzo and A. Rosselli
- 75 The Experiment in the History of Economics**
Edited by Philippe Fontaine and Robert Leonard
- 76 At the Origins of Mathematical Economics**
The economics of A.N. Isnard (1748–1803)
Richard van den Berg
- 77 Money and Exchange**
Folktales and reality
Sasan Fayazmanesh
- 78 Economic Development and Social Change**
Historical roots and modern perspectives
George Stathakis and Gianni Vaggi
- 79 Ethical Codes and income distribution**
A Study of John Bates Clark and Thorstein Veblen
Guglielmo Forges Davanzati
- 80 Evaluating Adam Smith**
Creating the Wealth of Nations
Willie Henderson

- 81 Civil Happiness**
Economics and human flourishing
in historical perspective
Luigino Bruni
- 82 New Voices on Adam Smith**
*Edited by Leonidas Montes and
Eric Schliesser*
- 83 Making Chicago Price Theory**
Milton Friedman–George Stigler
correspondence, 1945–1957
*Edited by J. Daniel Hammond
and Claire H. Hammond*
- 84 William Stanley Jevons and the
Cutting Edge of Economics**
Bert Mosselmans
- 85 A History of Econometrics in
France**
From nature to models
Philippe Le Gall
- 86 Money and Markets**
A doctrinal approach
*Edited by Alberto Giacomin and
Maria Cristina Marcuzzo*

PROOF ONLY

PROOF ONLY

Money and Markets

A doctrinal approach

Edited by **Alberto Giacomini** and
Maria Cristina Marcuzzo

ROOF ONLY

First published
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2007 Selection and editorial matter, Alberto Giacomin and Maria
Cristina Marcuzzo; individual chapters, the contributors

Typeset in Times by Wearset Ltd, Boldon, Tyne and Wear
Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJI Digital, Patstow, Cornwall

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or
utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now
known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in
any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing
from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Money and markets : a doctrinal approach / edited by Alberto Giocomin
and Maria Cristina Marcuzzo. – 1st ed.

p. cm. – (Routledge studies in the history of economics ; 86)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
1. Money. 2. Finance. I. Giacomin, Alberto. II. Marcuzzo, Maria Cristina,
1948–
HG221.M81415 2007
332.4–dc22

2006029606

ISBN 978-0-415-38403-2

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>List of illustrations</i> | xiii |
| <i>Notes on contributors</i> | xiv |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xvi |
| 1 Money and markets: Introduction | 1 |
| ALBERTO GIACOMIN AND MARIA CRISTINA MARCUZZO | |
| PART I | |
| Alternative representations of market and monetary relationships | 13 |
| 2 Monetary and social relationships | 15 |
| CHARLES A. E. GOODHART | |
| 3 Complexity theory's network conception of the individual | 30 |
| JOHN B. DAVIS | |
| 4 Does game theory offer 'new' mathematical images of economic reality? | 48 |
| GEORGIO ISRAEL | |
| PART II | |
| History of monetary ideas in the light of modern theory | 57 |
| 5 Money, markets and property | 59 |
| GUNNAR HEINSOHN AND OTTO STEIGER | |
| 6 Money and market as twin concepts? Some lessons from the recent history of market theory | 79 |
| JEAN CARTELIER | |

| | | |
|-----------------|---|-----|
| 7 | The monetary-policy relevance of an international settlement institution: the Keynes plan 60 years later | 96 |
| | SERGIO ROSSI | |
| 8 | Price and prejudice: the statics and dynamics of money-wage flexibility | 113 |
| | ANNAMARIA SIMONAZZI AND FERNANDO VIANELLO | |
| PART III | | |
| | At the origin of monetary ideas | 131 |
| 9 | Beyond the quantity theory: a reappraisal of Jean Bodin's monetary ideas | 133 |
| | JÉRÔME BLANC | |
| 10 | Money as a social bookkeeping device: from mercantilism to General Equilibrium theory | 150 |
| | HEINZ-PETER SPAHN | |
| 11 | Death in Venice – John Law: art collector, monetary theorist and corporate financier | 166 |
| | ANTOIN E. MURPHY | |
| 12 | Paper money: a reassessment of Adam Smith's view | 181 |
| | ALBERTO GIACOMIN | |
| PART IV | | |
| | Neglected contributions to monetary theory and policy | 201 |
| 13 | 'Incalculability' and the heterogeneity of agents in Frederick Lavington's monetary theory of markets | 203 |
| | CÉCILE DANGEL-HAGNAUER AND ALAIN RAYBAUT | |
| 14 | Profit rate, money and economic dynamics in Fanno's thought | 222 |
| | CRISTINA NARDI SPILLER AND MARIO POMINI | |
| 15 | Money and usury in the economics of Ezra Pound | 238 |
| | MEGHNAD DESAI | |
| | <i>Index</i> | 247 |

Illustrations

Figures

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| 7.1 | The two circuits of international money | 108 |
| 11.1 | Law's Financial System | 176 |
| 13.1 | The prospective net returns of a safe and a risky security | 207 |

Tables

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 7.1 | The result of an international payment in bancor in Keynes's plan | 100 |
| 7.2 | The result of an international payment in bancor: step I | 105 |
| 7.3 | The result of an international payment in bancor: step II | 107 |

Contributors

Jérôme Blanc is Associate Professor of Economics at the University of Lyon 2 'Lumière', France.

Jean Cartelier is Professor of Economics at the University of Paris X-Nanterre, France.

Cécile Dangel-Hagnauer is Associate Professor at the University of Nice-Sophia Antipolis, France.

John B. Davis is Professor of History and Philosophy of Economics at the University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands and Professor of Economics at Marquette University, USA.

Meghnad Desai is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the London School of Economics, United Kingdom.

Alberto Giacomin is Associate Professor of History of Economic Thought at the University of Venice 'Cà Foscari', Italy.

Charles A. E. Goodhart is Emeritus Professor of Banking and Finance, Financial Market Group, at the London School of Economics, United Kingdom.

Gunnar Heinsohn is Professor of Social Sciences at the University of Bremen, Germany.

Giorgio Israel is Professor of History of Mathematics at the University of Rome 'La Sapienza', Italy.

Maria Cristina Marcuzzo is Head of the Department of Economics at the University of Rome.

Antoin E. Murphy is Professor of Economics at Trinity College Dublin, Ireland.

Cristina Nardi Spiller is Professor of Macroeconomics and Economics of art at the University of Verona, Italy.

Mario Pomini is Professor of Economics at the University of Padua, Italy.

Alain Raybaut is Research Fellow at the University of Nice-Sophia Antipolis, France.

Sergio Rossi is Professor of Economics at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland.

Annamaria Simonazzi is Professor of Political Economy at the University of Rome 'La Sapienza', Italy.

Heinz-Peter Spahn is Professor of Economics at the University of Hohenheim, Germany.

Otto Steiger is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the University of Bremen, Germany.

Fernando Vianello is Professor of Macroeconomics and History of Economic Analysis at the University of Rome 'La Sapienza', Italy.

PROOF ONLY

Acknowledgements

Brought together in this volume is a selection from the papers presented at the 8th ESHET Conference held in Treviso and Venice on 26–29 February 2004.

Without implicating them in any way, we wish to express our thanks to Tony Aspromourgos, Alberto Baccini, Tony Brewer, Pascal Bridel, Victoria Chick, Ghislain Deleplace, Michel De Vroey, Bruna Ingraio, David Laidler, Arrigo Opocher, Ugo Pagano, Alessandro Roncaglia, Annalisa Rosselli, Bertram Schefold and Roy Weintraub, whose comments and criticisms have been of great help to us in preparing the volume.

In our Introduction we address those issues to which, in our view and in our understanding of the topic, these papers provide a contribution. However, they can and, we hope, will be read following other threads. We have, therefore, chosen not to take them in the same order of presentation as in the table of contents, to stress that our Introduction reflects what *we* have been stimulated to ponder and learned by reading and editing this book.